

# GHAJAR EXHIBIT 29

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 1

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

_____ RICHARD KADREY, et al.,	)	
Individual and	)	
Representative	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	
v.	)	Case No.:
	)	3:23-cv-03417-VC
META PLATFORMS, INC.,	)	
Defendant.	)	
_____	)	

\*\* HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY \*\*  
Videotaped 30(b)(1) deposition of  
NIKOLAY BASHLYKOV  
Volume I

Thursday, December 5, 2024

London, England  
United Kingdom

Reported stenographically by:  
Leah M. Willersdorf,  
RMR, CRR, FBIVR, ACR, QRR2\*, CLR

\_\_\_\_\_  
DIGITAL EVIDENCE GROUP  
1730 M. Street, NW, Suite 812  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
(202) 232-0646

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 12

1 working on, like, language modeling.

2 Q. Is that the GenAI group?

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. GenAI group within Meta?

5 A. Correct.

6 Q. So would it be fair to say that you are  
7 also employed by Meta?

8 A. That legal point, I -- yeah, I don't know.

9 Q. Okay.

10 MR. WEINSTEIN: I think it's easier just  
11 to refer to his employer as Meta rather than Facebook  
12 UK, so...

13 MR. YOUNG: Okay.

14 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

15 MR. YOUNG: Great.

16 BY MR. YOUNG:

17 Q. And you testified that you are currently a  
18 software engineer at Meta; is that correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. Okay. And how long have you been in that  
21 role?

22 A. Since August twenty twenty -- I just don't

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 31

1 correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay, thank you.

4 So, sir, just looking at this paragraph

5 here, it says you were a key contributor to LLaMA 2,

6 LLaMA 3 and LLaMA 3.1, right?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Okay. So the LLaMA models, those are  
9 large language models that have been developed and  
10 distributed by Meta, correct?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. Okay. And the LLaMA 2 models -- the  
13 LLaMA 2 series of models was released sometime in July  
14 of 2023, correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Okay. And the LLaMA 3 series of models  
17 was released sometime in January of this year,  
18 correct?

19 A. I don't remember the exact month.

20 Q. Okay. But it was released sometime early  
21 this year, correct?

22 A. Correct.

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 45

1           As part of your responsibilities, this is  
2   with respect to LLaMA 3, was it also part of your job  
3   responsibilities to write scripts for LLaMA 3?

4           A.    What do you mean "scripts by LLaMA 3"?

5           Q.    As part of your responsibility for  
6   LLaMA 3, did you write source code for LLaMA 3?

7           A.    For some parts, I did.

8           Q.    Okay. Now, did you also write source code  
9   or scripts that removed, for example, PII in datasets?

10          A.    I had scripts for cleaning, yes.

11          Q.    Okay. And by PII, you understand I mean  
12   to be personally identifying information, for example  
13   email addresses or phone numbers?

14          A.    Some of this information.

15          Q.    Okay. Now, you also wrote scripts to  
16   detect for repetition, correct?

17          A.    In our understanding of "repetition," yes.

18          Q.    Okay, thank you.

19                Now, you also wrote scripts to detect  
20   copyright -- and by "copyright," I mean what Meta  
21   understood as copyright -- correct?

22                MR. WEINSTEIN: Object to form.

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 46

1 THE WITNESS: Could you repeat again  
2 the question, please?

3 BY MR. YOUNG:

4 Q. Yes. Did you -- as part of your  
5 responsibilities at LLaMA [sic], did you, sir, write  
6 source code or scripts that you specifically called  
7 copyright?

8 A. The scripts were not called copyright.

9 Q. Okay. Were the scripts designed to detect  
10 copyright material -- excuse me.

11 Were the scripts or source code that you  
12 wrote designed to detect words that commonly would  
13 indicate copyright and copyrighted material?

14 A. The scripts, as far as I recollect,  
15 identified "copyright" as a word and probably a few  
16 other symbols.

17 Q. Okay. Like, for example, the C symbol  
18 within the circle, was that one of the icons that you  
19 identified?

20 A. That could be, if I see the source code,  
21 yes.

22 Q. Okay. And this script that we're talking

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 47

1 about, how it generally worked was that it would  
2 search data for specific words and if it detected that  
3 word, it would remove the line of the data that it  
4 detected the word in, correct?

5 A. It depends on the logic. Either -- so the  
6 logic is a bit more sophisticated than that.

7 Q. Okay. But forgiving my layperson's  
8 understanding and description of the source code, what  
9 I described is generally at a high level correct,  
10 right?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Okay. And if -- there were certain terms  
13 that you would identify or that the script would  
14 identify for flagging and removal, right?

15 A. Sorry, could you repeat again?

16 Q. Yes. So there were certain terms that  
17 the script would identify and remove the line if it  
18 detected the word in it, right?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Okay. And "copyright" being one of those  
21 words, right?

22 A. Yes.

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 48

1 Q. Okay. And certain symbols, for example,  
2 as we discussed, right?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Okay. In other words, that may be  
5 commonly found in the beginning or the end of certain  
6 books, correct?

7 MR. WEINSTEIN: Object to form.

8 THE WITNESS: In the script, there was --  
9 okay. Could you repeat the question?

10 BY MR. YOUNG:

11 Q. Yes, absolutely. Let me get a little more  
12 specific.

13 So in the scripts that you wrote to detect  
14 for words associated with copyright, or what Meta --  
15 what you labeled as copyright, did it search a  
16 particular portion in the front of the book and also  
17 in the back of the book?

18 A. As far as I remember, there was some logic  
19 of checking specifically in the beginning and in the  
20 end of the book.

21 Q. Because in the beginning of the book is  
22 typically where you see words like "ISBN" or "Table of



12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 49

1 Contents" or "Acknowledgments," correct?

2 A. Usually in the beginning and in the end of  
3 the book there are certain headers which are  
4 irrelevant for training.

5 Q. And this information would be information  
6 such as the copyright date, right?

7 A. That's part of it, yes.

8 Q. Okay. Or perhaps the name of the author?

9 A. No. We didn't check for the name of the  
10 author.

11 Q. But you did check for the word "author,"  
12 right?

13 A. I do not remember, but if you have the  
14 source code, you can check.

15 Q. Okay. And you also checked for the word  
16 "content," right?

17 A. Again, I can only speculate because  
18 I don't remember the code that I wrote, like, almost  
19 two years ago, but we could have looked into the Table  
20 of Contents.

21 Q. Okay, thank you. Okay.

22 Now, sir, you under -- you understand,

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 156

1 A. I think that is some general description.  
2 It might not be 100 percent correct, so it's better to  
3 refer to the script itself, if you...

4 Q. Okay. But this is just you reporting  
5 generally, at a high level, what this script does?

6 A. Yes. Somewhat, yes.

7 Q. Okay. And then similarly, for PII data,  
8 right, it says "Remove emails," right?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Okay. So the PII script is just detecting  
11 and removing email addresses from the data, correct?

12 A. As far as I can read from here, and also  
13 better to consult to the code base itself, it is only  
14 this, yes.

15 Q. Okay, great. And then the next row talks  
16 about copyright, right?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Okay. Can you read for me that bullet  
19 point, please.

20 A. "Remove rows containing copyright in the  
21 first and last 25% of the book."

22 Q. Okay, great. And then the next bullet

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 157

1 describes the words that you were actually searching  
2 for -- that the script was actually searching for to  
3 detect the rows to remove, correct?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Okay. Can you read for me that bullet  
6 point, please.

7 A. "Rows containing any of these words," and  
8 then in brackets 'ISBN,' 'Copyright,' symbol C, 'All  
9 Rights Reserved,' 'DOI.'"

10 Q. Okay. Do you remember who picked these  
11 words for the script?

12 A. I think it was myself after manual  
13 examination of the datasets.

14 Q. Okay. Did you choose these words in  
15 consultation with anyone?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Okay. Why did you pick these words to  
18 detect and remove from the dataset?

19 A. They commonly occurred in the books.  
20 They do not, to my understanding, bring any value to  
21 training and -- yeah.

22 Q. Okay. Why is it a problem if a word --

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 158

1 if these words commonly appear, and why did you feel  
2 like they needed to be removed from the dataset?

3 A. So commonly appear is not a problem.

4 A problem is that, like, it's, rather, the -- like,  
5 when you do filter, you look for particular patterns  
6 in the documents and you also try to -- because you  
7 can't filter all the useless tokens for training from  
8 all the documents, so you're usually focusing on some  
9 patterns that are prevalent in many of the documents,  
10 because with one script you can easily remove a lot of  
11 those unused token -- like, not-used-for-training  
12 tokens.

13 So that was the main kind of idea behind  
14 looking into some of the most commonly words that  
15 present in the documents.

16 Q. Okay, thank you.

17 Now, did you apply this copyright script  
18 to any other dataset?

19 A. I did not.

20 Q. Okay. Do you know if others applied this  
21 copyright script to other datasets?

22 A. I do not know of such cases.

12/5/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Nikolay Bashlykov, Vol I  
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 244

1 CERTIFICATE OF COURT REPORTER

2 I, LEAH M. WILLERSDORF, Registered Merit

3 Reporter, Certified Realtime Reporter, Fellow of the

4 British Institute of Verbatim Reporters, Qualified

5 Realtime Reporter Level 2, and Certified LiveNote

6 Reporter, do hereby certify that:

7 NIKOLAY BASHLYKOV appeared before me on

8 Thursday, December 05, 2024, was sworn by me and was

9 thereupon examined by counsel; that the testimony of

10 said witness was taken by me stenographically; that

11 the foregoing is a true and accurate record to the

12 best of my knowledge, skill and ability; that I am

13 neither a relative nor employee of any party to the

14 action in which this testimony was taken; that I am

15 neither relative nor employee of any attorney or

16 counsel employed by any party thereto; and, further,

17 I am not financially or otherwise interested in the

18 outcome of the action.

19

20



21 LEAH M. WILLERSDORF

RMR, CRR, FBIVR, ACR, QRR2, CLR

22 (December 08, 2024)